

SENATE OF PAKISTAN



REPORT OF THE SPECIAL COMMITTEE OF THE SENATE ON THE SITUATION IN SINDH

DECEMBER, 1989.

Reproduced by
Sani H. Panhwar (2023)

FOREWORD

The Senate of Pakistan in its Session on 2nd August, 1988 discussed the Adjournment Motions moved on 21st July, 1988, by Prof. Khurshid Ahmed, Mr. Muhammad Tariq Chaudhry, Mr. Javed Jabbar, Akhunzada Behrawar Saeed, Qazi Abdul Latif, Mr. Aijaz Ali Khan Jatoi and Mr. Ahmed Mian Soomro (including call attention of Mr. Javed Jabbar) on the disturbances in Karachi and Hyderabad and the deteriorating law and order situation in the area. Consequently, the Chairman, Senate was authorized by the House on 4th August, 1988 to form a Special Committee on the situation in Sindh.

In pursuance of the decision of the Senate, formation of the Special Committee, including its Chairman, was announced by the Chairman, Senate of Pakistan, in the House on August 11th, 1988,

The Committee consisted of the following members, namely:-

1. Mr. Ahmed Mian Soomro.	Chairman
2. Nawabzada Jehangir Shah Jogeza	Member
3. Mr. Hussain Bakhsh Bungulzai.	Member
4. Mr. Muhammad Tariq Chaudhry.	Member
5. Mr. Muhammad Ali Khan.	Member
6. Akhunzada Behrawar Saeed.	Member
7. Mr. Amir Abdullah Khan Rokri.	Member
8. Mr. Aijaz Ali Khan Jatoi.	Member
9. Mr. Javed Jabbar.	Member
10. Prof. Khurshid Ahmed.	Member
11. Minister for Interior.	Ex-Officio Member

Two more members, that is, Mr. Abdul Majid Kazi and Syed Faseih Iqbal, were included in the Committee by the permission of the Acting Chairman, Senate respectively on 15th September and 11th October, 1988. Mr. Javed Jabbar, however, resigned vide his letter dated 5th December, 1988. The Committee was also extended valuable assistance by Mr. Aziz Ahmed Qureshi, Secretary, Senate and Mr. Shahid Iqbal, ex-officio Secretary of the Special Committee who took active participation in its deliberation and drafting of its report.

The Committee, in the light of the terms of reference spelled out by the Chairman Senate, laid down the following as the task it would like to accomplish:

- 1) The Study of the socio-political situation obtaining in Sindh.

- 2) An analysis of the nature of the prevalent unrest and the general worsening of the law-and-order situation in the province, manifesting itself in periodic incidents of large-scale rioting, arson and violence, particularly, in the urban centers.
- 3) Identification of the underlying causes of the prevalent slate of affairs and the factors which feed it and keep the social tensions alive.
- 4) Formulation of a strategy and recommendations for the improvement of the situation.

The Committee was also assigned to:

- a) Hold consultations with the leaders of all shades of public opinion and political leanings in the province and ascertain their views and suggestions, and also solicit their help and cooperation in establishing peaceful conditions on an enduring basis; and
- b) Meet other prominent citizens and administrative authorities, both at the provincial and local levels, exploring with their help the public grievances and local problems of general importance and seeking their views on how best to resolve them.

The Committee held its first meeting on 15th August, 1988 in the Parliament House, Islamabad and discussed in detail the modalities and procedure to regulate its deliberations. It chalked out a detailed programme of visits to various places in Sindh. The Committee, reflecting upon the approach it would adopt, resolved in the very beginning that it would study the issue with an open mind and judge the situation in Sindh with complete objectivity and impartiality. It also decided, in accordance with its terms of reference, that it would meet persons representing various shades of opinion in different walks of life. Further, it would make every possible effort to study and ascertain causes of the situation as it prevailed in the Province of Sindh and make such recommendations as would create harmony in the said Province. Its approach would thus be forward-looking and it would like to make realistic proposals to solve this complex problem.

The Committee visited Karachi on 29th and 30th August, 1988 and met the Governor, Senior Minister, Senior Provincial Government Officials and public representatives. The third session of the Committee was held from 21st to 29th September, 1988 during which the Committee met at Karachi, Sann, Mehar, Jamshoro, Dadu and Hyderabad and interviewed a large number of officials and public representees. The Committee again met in Islamabad on October 4, 1988 for its fourth session to interview some of the Government officials. The Committee once again visited Karachi on October 31, 1988

and remained in session for two days interviewing a number of political leaders, educationists and Government officials. The Committee also called upon the Acting President on 20th October, 1988 and apprised him of the work done by the Committee up to that time and made certain recommendations of immediate nature to ensure peaceful conduct of elections in the province. The Committee held its sixth session in Islamabad on November 22-23, 1988 to review the work done so far and also interviewed certain other Government officials. The seventh session of the Committee was convened in Islamabad on 15th and 16th January, 1989 in the Parliament House in which it once again interviewed still more Government officials.

The Committee held its eighth session in Islamabad on 5th March, 1989 and considered the drafting of its report. It was decided to appoint a five-member Sub-Committee, consisting of the following members, to draft the said report:

- | | | |
|----|----------------------------------|-------------|
| 1. | Prof. Khurshid Ahmed. | Convener |
| 2. | Akhunzada Behrawar Saeed. | Co-Convener |
| 3. | Mr. Muhammad Tariq Chaudhry. | Member |
| 4. | Nawabzada Jehanqir Shah Jomezai. | Member |
| 5. | Mr. Abdul Majid Kazi. | Member |

The Sub-Committee held a number of meetings (5th March, 1989, 15th March, 1989) and formulated the scheme of the report and considered some drafts on preliminary section of the report and on the socio-economic situation.

The Special Committee on Sindh met in Islamabad on 22nd April, 1989 and on 6th June 1989 to review the work done so far and improve the proposed format of the report along with some of its short-term recommendations. Prof. Khurshid Ahmad was requested to produce a new draft of the report to be considered by the Committee in its next meeting. The final draft of the report was presented to the Special Committee on Sindh in its meetings held on 6-6-1989, 28-8-1989, 29-8-1989, 18-9-1989, 30-9-1989, 17-10-1989, 18-10-1989, 21-11-89 & 22-11-89, 11-11-1989, 15-11-89, 16-11-89, which after detailed discussion, approved it with necessary modifications. The Committee has the honor of presenting the final report before the Senate.

(Ahmedmian Soomro)
Chairman

(Prof. Khurshid Ahmad)
Member/Chairman, Drafting Committee

Absent
(Aijaz Ali Khan Jatoi)

(Muhammad Ali Khan)
Member

(Mr. Hussain Bakhsh Bungulzai)
Member

(Nawabzada Jehanqir Shah Jogezi)
Member

(Abdul Majid Kazi)
Member

(Akhunzada Behrawar Saeed)
Member

Absent
Minister of Interior / (Ex-Officio Member)

Absent
(Amir Abdullah Khan Rokeri)
Member

INTRODUCTION

The province of Sindh is faced with a grim situation today, where law and order situation is fast deteriorating. Recurrent outbreak of a cycle of mass-violence, increasing rate of crimes, emergence of terrorist groups and organizations, polarization among the major ethnic communities living in the province, suspected role of external powers' involvement, a highly charged political atmosphere and an utter failure of the administrative machinery to cope with the law-and-order situation appear to have become persistent features of the political situation of Sindh.

The economic consequences of this State of affairs are devastating. The business community is shaken to its roots by unchecked crescendo of abductions for ransom, dacoities and robberies. On the one hand unemployment is increasing and on the other production is falling below capacity. Flight of capital from the province is on the increase.

Industrial production is suffering, rendering the whole economy into jeopardy. A province that was once leading the country into prosperity is now burning at both ends. The situation is too grave to be ignored. The very future of the country, both economic and political, is at stake. No challenge can be more devastating. How we arrive at this situation? What are the causes of the political deterioration, and ideological disintegration in Sindh? What can be done to change the trend? What could be an appropriate strategy to face this challenge? What specific short-term and long-term measures can be adopted to check the drift and ameliorate the situation?

The Senate Committee is of the considered opinion that a serious and concerted exercise to formulate a strategy and evolve a programme is the most pressing need of the hour. All resources must be harnessed, whether in the Government or the opposition, whether in the Parliament or outside, to face this challenging situation and seek its solution. This is a problem which deserves to be tackled by rising above party or personal considerations and with a view to protecting the country from the grave challenges that confront it.

The problem is also a complex one. What is happening today is not the result of any accident or sudden occurrence. It is the cumulative result of a number of factors and forces operating almost ever since the inception of Pakistan. While the immediate responsibility of a government in power cannot be totally ignored, it would be unfair to put all the blame at one door. As such the problem deserves to be examined in depth, in

the context of a socio-political situation that has engulfed the country over a period of four decades. The failures of omission and commission are a legion, and unless all major factors and forces are objectively identified, the problem would evade solution. This calls for a rigorous post-mortem of policies and practices pursued over the years under different regimes, each making its own contribution towards aggravating the problem. To discern this tangled web we need a cumulative effort embracing the objectivity of a scientist, the acumen of a statesman, the passion of a patriot and the vision of a planner. The members of the Committee are conscious of their limitations, yet the seriousness of the challenge has forced them to undertake this exercise. We are making this effort in all humility and only with the hope that a breakthrough has to be sought whatever be the risks and pitfalls and, however, small an opening can be made, to begin with.

The Senate Special Committee on Sindh conducted extensive tours and held interviews over the past fifteen months with a cross-section of people in Sindh, that is, politicians, bureaucrats, educationists, professionals, heads of various ethnic groups and common citizens. It sought to find out the answers to the above question with all frankness and honesty, the Senate Committee is of the considered opinion that it would be a grave misperception to view the situation which can be rectified by improved administrative measures alone. In fact, the existing situation in Sindh is very complex. It is the result of failure of successive regimes' policies in multi-dimensional respects: political, cultural, economic, demographic and administrative. External factors have further complicated the situation. This state of affairs in Sindh is certainly a cause of great concern for every Pakistani and requires urgent and comprehensive measures. The Committee has tried to discuss political, cultural, economic, demographic and administrative causes of the present crisis in Sindh and is suggesting, both short term and long-term measures to cope with the challenge. It is our conviction that the situation is very serious, but certainly not beyond repair. Given the political will and appropriate mix of multi-dimensional strategies, it can still be resolved amicably, Inshaallah.

Chapter 2

HISTORICAL AND SOCIO-POLITICAL BACKGROUND

Sindh is the heart of Pakistan and its gateway to the world. Bounded by the neighboring Pakistan provinces of Punjab on the north and Baluchistan on the West, it has a common border with India in the east and South-east and extends along 150 miles of the Arabian sea coast on the south and south-west. It covers an area of 54,407 square miles (140,407 square kilometers) of Pakistan's total area of 307,374 square miles (796,095 square kilometers). Its population (over 25.057 million accounts for twenty three percent of the Pakistan's total population (106.7 million). Its relative position has increased as its population in 1947 was only 17% of the population of the when West Pakistan. Demographically speaking it has been the fastest, growing province. The rate of growth of population in Sindh, in comparison to the rate of growth of population in Pakistan, was as follows:

Rate of Growth over previous Census Year		
Year	Sindh	Pakistan
1951	1.8	1.8
1964	3.2	2.4
1971	4.6	3.5
1981	3.6	3.1

Karachi, the largest city of Pakistan, accounts for about one third of the population of the province in official figures. Unofficially it is claimed that the population of Karachi is higher. Karachi and its twin city of Port Qasim, are the main ports of the country. Karachi can also be described as the economic and financial capital of the country, Sindh constitutes the economic life-line of Pakistan, not only because of the financial center and port of Karachi, but also because of the place it occupies in agriculture, industry and resources of energy. Of the four major agricultural crops, wheat, rice, cotton and sugarcane, it produces about 18%, 52%, 17% and 24% respectively (figures for 1906-87). In industry, out of 4,047 industrial units, reported in the Industrial Census of Pakistan, 1967 are located in Sindh providing daily employment to 211,087 persons out of 475,957 persons for Pakistan. The share of Sindh in the net value added, from these units comes to Rs. 22, 596 million as against Rs. 45,021 million for the whole of Pakistan, that is, about fifty percent.¹

¹ Based on Industrial Census for 1983-84. Source: Economic Indicators By Provinces, Bureau of Statistics, Planning & Development, Government of Sindh.

Sindh has an old cultural history. Ideologically Islam came to the subcontinent through Sindh, that is, why it is known as *babul Islam*. The peace and tranquility witnessed by Sindh, gave its people vast opportunities to develop its culture - language, literature and religion. The Sindhi language is a highly developed language. First translation of the Holy Quran in the Sub-continent was in Sindhi. One who is proficient in Sindhi language, can copy any vocal sound in the world. Sindh has a high tradition of learning and research. Thatta, as a seat of learning during the Muslim era, could compete with any of the universities of the world. Sindh has produced learned people, some of whom have even taught the Quran and Hadith at Makka and Madina. The British also gave due recognition to the language. Sindhi continued as a court language and official records were maintained in both Sindhi and English.

This province was one of the last places conquered by the British after stiff resistance. The British tried to punish the Muslim people of Sindh (75 percent of the population at that time and the real force to resist British invasion) by annexing Sindh to the Bombay presidency and by ensuring the domination of Hindus over the Muslims. As a result of the new land policy, educational policy and the introduction of British civil courts the economic and political landscape began to change adversely against the Muslims and in favor of the Hindus. According to Mountford,

The position of the Zamindar has not improved under British rule. That he should retain his feudal power and patriarchal authority was not to be expected But it was part of that policy to reduce natural leaders of the people to insolvency and force them to part with their ancestral estates. This nevertheless was the almost immediate effect of the introduction of regular British administration.²

The introduction of British civil courts administered a heavier blow to the Muslim agriculturist whose land now began to move into the hands of the Hindu money lenders. Aitken observes,

"The facilities offered by the civil courts for recovery of debts, the enforced sale of land in execution of a decree the admirable opportunities that the civil law afforded to the stronger intellect for cheating and deluding the weaker intellect, stimulated the money lenders to advance far in excess of what had been his former limit viz, the surplus of the Zamindars crop."³

The result was a fast transfer of land from the Muslim land owners to the Hindu money lenders. Hamida Khuro quotes a report by Sir Even James focusing on the situation in 1896, that is, almost fifty years after the advent of the British rule:

² Mountford, Pamphlet on "Relations between Debtor and Creditor", quoted in Aitken, E. H., *A Gazetteer of the Province of Sindh*, Karachi, 1907, p.336.

³ Aitken, *ibid*, p. 337.

- "1. More than 42% of the arable land in the province was now owned, or held in beneficiary possession under mortgage, by Hindus.
2. For every acre taken by a Hindu from the government about three acres were bought from the Musalmans.
3. During the preceding seven years the land parted with by sale, or by mortgage with possession, to Hindus amounted to more than of 22% of the whole occupied areas."⁴

A similar tragedy was unfolding itself in the field of education. With the neglect of the old traditional Muslim system of education and the development of a now secular educational system Hindus were stealing a march ahead of the Muslims and dominating in all services. Literate Hindus were 9.3% (with men at 15.8) and while Muslims were only 0.74% (with men at 1.26%). Writes Hamida Khuro:

"In education as in agriculture Muslims were losing their influence and hold In spite of some dedicated and pioneering educators in the community, Muslims were unable to catch up for the next half century and Hindus filled government servile."⁵

While we don't want to generalize it may be added as a digression, that we were intrigued to note that while non-Muslims constitute less than 4 percent of the population of Sindh today, according to the figures provided by the Principal Chandka Medical College, Larkana, the percentage of non-Muslim students during the last decade has varied between 14.19% (1981-8?) to 23.47% (1988-89) in Chandka Medical College alone. Presently the total non-Muslim population of Sindh is around 1 million in a total population of 25 million. Detailed break up, as provided by the Home Secretary, Sindh, is as follows:

Hindus & scheduled casts	815,157
Christians	95,777
Parsis	8,933
Buddhists	2,736
Qadianis	25,987
Others	20,521

In 1941 Hindus constituted 64% of the Urban Sindh while the Muslims percentage was only 33. In 1917 Hindus owned 42% of total land and were holding 22% in mortgage as

⁴ Hamida Khuro, *The Making of Modern Sindh; British Policy and Social Change in the Nineteenth Century*, Indus Publications, Karachi, 1978, p. 308

⁵ *Ibid*, p. 308.

against the fact that when the British overtook Sindh in 1813 hundred percent land was owned by the Muslims.

It was in this background of victimization of the Muslims that the movement for the separation of Sindh from Bombay was launched and vehemently pursued by Muslims of Sindh and finally succeeded in 1936 despite opposition from the Hindus and the Indian National Congress.

The Muslims of Sindh not only became conscious of their Islamic identity but also of their exploitation at the hands of the Hindus and the British. They became the vanguard of the Muslim struggle for Pakistan. Sindh Muslim League had the distinct honor of adopting a resolution in favor of Pakistan even before the historic March 1940 resolution of All India Muslim League. Sindh Assembly was the first assembly to pass the Pakistan resolution. The Government of Sindh had the unique honor of inviting the Quaid-i-Azam and the Federal Government of Pakistan to establish their offices in Karachi after independence.

The question therefore arises is as to why the tables were turned, and what were the causes that changed the scenario almost beyond recognition.

MAJOR CAUSES OF THE CRISIS

The crisis that has engulfed Sindh, alienated a brother from a brother, generated a climate of suspicion, antagonism and confrontation, created an unprecedented law and order situation in a land that was known for its traditions of affection on hospitality and accommodation is a multi-dimensional phenomenon. Its causes are many and now somewhat deep-seated. An effort is being made to identify some of the major causes.

I

THE IDEOLOGICAL FACTORS

Pakistan was established on the basis of Islam as the homeland of the Muslims of the Pak-Hind subcontinent. The struggle for Pakistan was waged and heroically fought in all the nooks and corners of the British India. Greatest sacrifices were made by people living in all parts of the subcontinent, some destined to become part of Pakistan, some not expected to be part of that sanctuary. It was not merely the vote cast in Lahore, Karachi, Dacca, Sylhet, Peshawar and Quetta that led to the establishment of Pakistan, it was also the votes cast at Delhi, Bombay, Calcutta, Patna, Lucknow, Madras, Jabalpur, etc., that finally tilted the balance in favor of Pakistan. The riots of Bihar, Calcutta and Delhi created the scenario in which Pakistan became Inevitable. Pakistan on the 14th August, 1947, emerged as a nation state: but the concept of nation on which this state is based is different.

It is the nation of Islam in the subcontinent which sought its destiny in Pakistan. The idea was a challenge to the Western notions of territorial nationalism and secular statehood. Islam was the rallying point, the cementing force for people speaking different languages, representing different ethnic stocks and living in different habitations. Islam illumined for them the vision of a Society and statecraft based on the principles of brotherhood, justice, fairplay, respect for human rights, economic welfare and democracy as enjoined in the Holy Quran and Sunnah. Islam was not a mere word, an empty slogan; it represents a concept of life, a vision of the future and a new social order.

The tragedy of Pakistan lies in the neglect, even at times rebellion, against the ideology on which the country was based and which provided the glue to keep all its parts together. Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the father of the nation, died within thirteen months of the establishment of the country. The first Prime Minister Khan Liaquat Ali Khan was martyred. The direction of state and society set in the Objectives Resolution, adopted by the Constituent Assembly on 12th March, 1949, was lost, People

who had no role in the Pakistan Movement were able to wield the reins of authority. Democratic principles were ignored. Policies based on secularism and petty interest, personal as well as parochial, were pursued with impunity. The spirit of the Pakistan movement was strangled. It took 9 years to frame the first Constitution, and within two years the constitution was torn to pieces. President Ayub gave a new constitution in 1962 which dropped the Objective Resolution and changed the name of the country from "The Islamic Republic of Pakistan" to the "Republic of Pakistan". Education, which was the key to the orientation of future generations, remained steeped in secular values and norms and continued to serve the goals and objectives set by colonial masters to produce mercenaries for their regime. Information and media policy moved in similar grooves. There was no effort to develop a strategy for economic development which would ensure balanced development of all regions and equitable distribution of the fruits of development amongst people belonging to all strata of society and living in all parts of the country. Western capitalist model was imitated blindly without realizing how contradictory it was to the ideals and principles of Islam, what disasters it had produced in countries where it originated and what changes were being made in those very countries.

The second basic demand of the ideology of Pakistan was the establishment of a democratic order, ensuring fundamental rights to all citizens of the state, providing for their active participation in the processes of decision-making, and allocating resources in a manner that healthy federalism could prosper in the country. Instead of pursuing this path, the ruling elite opted for concentration of power in its own hands neglecting the development and consolidation of political parties, political processes and political traditions. Personalized politics, emergence of bureaucracy as the arbiter of power, neglect of the political worker, pursuit of parochial and provincial ends to the neglect of the wider national interest or the grievances of the weak and the small became the order of the day. First indirect (1953) and then direct (1958) participation of the Armed forces in politics completed the scenario for letting down the Ideology of Pakistan.

This also provided those, who had never reconciled with the idea of Pakistan, whether living within its boundaries or operating from beyond, with an opportunity to feed ideas and arouse movements which would lead to the weakening of the country and God its disintegration.

This had been the predicament of Pakistan on the ideological front. Facts, however bitter must be faced squarely, then and only then the wrongs can be remedied. If diagnosis is faulty, the remedy will always allude our grip.

II POLITICAL FACTORS

The most significant long-term cause of the political crisis in Sindh has been the absence of a genuinely participatory democratic system in the country. It is the perception of lack of political participation on the part of the majority of Sindhis, especially since the ascendancy of the military bureaucratic elite since 1953, which has primarily been responsible for their gradual alienation. As the military-bureaucratic elite has been ruling the country for most of its history, the people of Sindh (and also those of some other provinces), who had not been properly represented in these two institutions, saw themselves deprived of any share of power. This perception, that they are being ruled by "alien" institutions, dominated by other groups, was strengthened during the first Martial Law era (1958-69) and perpetuated during the second (1969-71) and the third Martial law (1977-85). The separation of Karachi from Sindh hurt the people of Sindh, the formation of one unit under duress was a shock to the people of Sindh. Centralization of political power and administrative control created unsurmountable difficulties for the people of the province. The people of Sindh and other provinces groaned under feelings of deprivation from participation in the Government of the country. Even genuine complaints were not heeded to. All this further aggravated the situation.

There appear certain striking similarities among all the Martial Law regimes, both in terms of policies and the consequences for the politics of Sindh. These regimes pursued a policy of some kind of "controlled democracy", ideally favoring "party-less politics". These regimes pursued one-unit policy, overtly, as in the first period and covertly, as in the last one. Martial law, after all, means centralization of power and authority. These regimes resorted to the use of force to silence their opponents. These regimes continued to maintain recruitment policies in the army and the bureaucracy which failed to ensure full and proportional participation by persons coming from all regions of the country especially of Sindhi speaking population.

As regards this disparity some idea can be had of the situation from the following: Khalid B. Sayed in a study about the situation as it prevailed in the 1960's shows that 60 percent of army consisted of the Punjabis, 35 percent were Pushtuns, and others constituted the remaining five percent. Among the top 48 generals, 17 were from Punjab, 19 from NWFP, 11 were Mohajirs and only 1 was a Bengali.⁶

This situation created a deep sense of deprivation, which was exploited by the extremist elements in the direction of ethnic nationalism; Sindhi, Punjabi, Pakhtoon, Mohajir, etc.

⁶ Khalid B. Sayed, *The Role of Military in Pakistan in Armed Forces and Society*, Ed. by Jacques Van Dooron, Hague: Paris, Monton, 1968.

It is not to deny certain constraints which might have influenced this situation, but it is also undeniable that this disbalance, particularly in few of long spells of Martial Law and non-availability of representative forums for decision-making, has affected the political climate and the way of thinking of a number of people in the country.

The consequences of the policies of the Martial Law regimes were also little different. The controlled democracy was no substitute for a real democracy in the absence of real power-sharing, the perception of domination of other groups among the Sindhis gained ground, as it did in East Pakistan in the sixties. Ironically the regimes' desire to control major political parties led them to tolerate and even encourage ethnic politics in the context of a model of party-less politics. No wonder that much of the literature of regional nationalism was produced during the 1958, Martial Law. The 1977 Martial Law witnessed the flowering of militant regionalist organizations based on that ideology. The message of Sindhi nationalism, and its counterparts in the form of Mohajir and other nationalisms, began to permeate among the masses leading to- extremely violent movements since 1983, affecting most of the province. We have no intention to condone the role of those political forces which resorted to instruments of violence in politics and which resorted to attacks on persons, post offices, railways, banks, courts and other institutions, yet, the fact of absence of representative institutions, providing ground for such actions, too cannot be ignored.

The policy of overt or covert "one-unitism" pursued left little room of genuine provincial autonomy, the educated intelligentsia in Sindh began to feel that a strong and authoritarian center, dominated by other ethnic groups, was bent upon eradicating their separate cultural entity. As a reaction to the One-Unit policies mushroomed a variety of cultural organizations in Sindh with the objective of saving Sindhi culture. These organizations somehow began to perform the role of socializing agencies for the younger generations in the school of Sindhi nationalism.

Maintenance of recruitment policies, formulated during the colonial period in the army as well as bureaucracy ever since the creation of this country, left the Sindhis (and also the Baluchis) seriously unrepresented in these two institutions particularly the Armed Forces. These two institutions, for the people of some parts of the country, remained somewhat unrepresented of the total spectrum of the society. A feeling of ill-will and resentment grew among the sections of population in Sindh - (further intensified by the political role of these two institutions) leading to a widely held perception that these two institutions failed to represent the totality of the national landscape. Failure of the successive regimes in Pakistan to diversify the recruitment base of these two institutions played a significant role of causing grievances among the people of Sindh.

II CULTURE FACTORS

Cultural factors, which led to the grievances among the Sindhi population, may be examined at two levels: social and governmental. With the mass exodus of the Hindus, both from the urban and the rural areas of Sindh after the partition, and the arrival of the refugees in the wake of independence in 1947, there emerged problems of cultural interaction among diverse ethnic groups which were mishandled by the government and social elite. Initially, the Mohajirs began to settle in various parts of Sindh and there existed a feeling of brotherhood and cordiality among the local population and the refugees. However, the government adopted the policy of settling the refugees in separate enclaves, primarily in the urban areas of Sindh. As a consequence of this policy, the refugees somehow began to form their own separate cultural bases and their cultural interaction with the local population was significantly reduced. The local Sindhis also complained that encouraged by the preferential policy of the government towards the Mohajirs in the early years, some of them began to show disrespect towards the Sindhi culture. Somehow an impression began to emerge, and it was further blown up by vested interests, that the refugees consider themselves as culturally superior people as compared to the local population. This produced tension between the Sindhis and the Mohajirs. No serious effort was made by the government on the social and political front in the country to carefully assess the situation and set it right. Distortions persisted and were exaggerated and exploited by the vested interests with snow-balling effect. Timely action would have avoided this syndrome.

Furthermore, the attitude of some of the non-Sindhi bureaucrats, especially in the Civil service, remained steeped in the pre-independence traditions of colonial rule. This was interpreted as an attitude of arrogance and contempt towards the local population. Unable to understand the Sindhi language and culture, their attitude, especially during the First Martial Law was felt by many as one of "masters" towards the "subjects". It triggered several student demonstrations in Sindh in the early sixties. At state level, the issue of the Sindhi language was a critical one. Sindhi has been the official language of Sindh and a medium of instruction in schools and colleges since the pre-British period. It has been a well-developed language with rich literary heritage. Ayub government abolished both its official position and its use as a medium of instruction in Sindh under the influence of the Sharif Commission Report. It hurt the patriotic people of Sindh and set off a series of adverse reactions in the province. This also gave rise to serious apprehensions about the inline development of Sindhi language and literature education of children and their competitive position in search for job opportunities and other socio-economic contributions. Sindh is a bilingual province and a balanced development of the national language and the provincial language was the answer.

IV ECONOMIC FACTORS

One very significant cause of grievance among the Sindhi population can be traced to the issue of distribution of agricultural land which became available in the wake of the construction of new barrages on the river Indus. Contrary to the explicit promises of the first parliamentary government in Pakistan, the One Unit Government and the Martial Law regime (1958-69) granted some of the best agricultural lands at nominal rates to the senior military and civilian bureaucrats, mostly the Punjabis, refugees and Pushtuns, and the local peasants felt by-passed. This created a sharp reaction among the local population who perceived the distribution of land as unfair. Virtually all national newspapers and periodicals wrote against this decision of the Government. The Chief Secretary, Sindh also informed the Committee that immediately before the coming into being of Pakistan, a bill was passed by the Sindh Assembly according to which all the agricultural lands mortgaged with possession with Hindu money-lenders were to revert to the Muslim owners. However, after independence this bill was not assented to by the Governor with the result that these lands were declared as evacuee property and allotted to the refugees depriving Sindhi Muslim owners. In case of Punjab, such bill was passed and assented to by the Governor of Punjab and the land reverted to their Muslim owners. It has been reported to us that about four million acres of land was affected by such policies. This caused discontentment amongst the Sindhis.

The unbalanced economic development policies have been another important factor contributing to greater ethnic polarization in Sindh, the rural areas were neglected in terms of economic development priorities and the urban areas were paid relatively more attention. Lack of economic opportunities in the rural areas of Sindh and other provinces accelerated the flow of population from such areas towards the urban areas of Sindh, intensifying the competition of local population with other ethnic groups. Thus, top-sided development policies without any regard to the regional and ethnic considerations led to an increase in tensions between local and non-locals. Industrialization created new opportunities but recruitment policies pursued did not allow local labor to be fully absorbed, resulting in unemployment and under employment of local, youth. While the results of this lop-sided development strategy have appeared in all parts of the country, the reaction has been more severe in the province of Sindh.

It is apparent that disparity exists between the availability of educational facilities to people living in rural Sindh. The job opportunities are considerably lacking for the rural population in the private sector (industry and commerce). The only avenue open to them is government service and its subordinate offices - both Federal and Provincial. This matter relates to the country as a whole. As regards the share of Sindh in Federal Government jobs, some details are given in the table below:

GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN ESTABLISHMENT DIVISION											
STATEMENT SHOWING DOMICILE-WISE REPRESENTATION OF ALL PAKISTAN UNIFIED POSTS OFFICERS OF D.M.G., POLICE, SECRETARIAT GROUPS HOLDING POSTS UNDER THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT DATE:											
25/02/1989											
Sr.No	B.P.S.	Total number of officers	N.W.F.P.	PUNJAB	SINDH URBAN	SINDH RURAL	BALUCHISTAN	A.G.&.K.	N. AREAS	F.A.T.A.	UNSPECIFIED
DISTRICT MANAGEMENT GROUP											
TOTAL		500 (150)	95 (17.5)	301 (53.7)	40 (7.1)	48 (8.5)	39 (6.8)	10 (1.7)	5 (1.4)	19 (2.8)	0
	22	3 (100)	0	3 (16.6)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	21	18 (100)	5 (27.7)	13 (57.1)	1 (5.5)	0	0	0	0	0	0
	30	35 (120)	19 (34.2)	17 (43.8)	0	2 (5.5)	3 (5.5)	1 (0.8)	0	0	0
	19	105 (150)	29 (27.6)	45 (42.8)	7 (6.6)	6 (5.7)	13 (12.3)	1 (0.9)	1 (0.9)	3 (0.6)	0
	18	211 (66)	35 (14.2)	127 (60)	14 (6.6)	15 (7.1)	11 (5.2)	4 (1.8)	2 (0.9)	8 (3.7)	0
	17	158	22 (11.7)	97 (51.5)	16 (9.5)	25 (13.2)	12 (6.3)	4 (2.1)	5 (2.6)	5 (2.6)	0
Note: (Figures even in brackets shows wage distribution)											
Source: Establishment Division Gradation list 1989											

TABLE 4											
EMPLOYEES OF AUTONOMOUS SEMI-AUTONOMOUS CORPORATIONS/BODIES UNDER THE ADMINISTRATIVE CONTROL OF THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT BY PROVINCE/REGION OF DOMICILE											
S.No.	Pay Scale	Employees (Total)	Punjab	SINDH		N.W.F.P.	Baluchistan	Azad Kashmir	Northern Area	Federally administered Tribal Areas	Outside Pakistan (Abroad)
				Urban	Rural						
1	Maximum of which is Rs. 6500 or above	776	382	288	36	46	10	6	0	2	0
2	Maximum of which ranges between Rs. 6000 to Rs. 6499	687	357	227	35	40	13	3	1	5	0
3	Maximum of which ranges between Rs. 5240 to Rs. 5999	920	409	343	47	70	19	7	2	14	0
4	Maximum of which ranges between Rs. 4480 to Rs. 5239	3587	1694	1231	209	284	74	24	0	41	9
5	Maximum of which ranges between Rs. 3040 to Rs. 4479	24086	11435	7317	1712	2440	450	305	5	187	16
6	Maximum of which ranges between Rs. 2250 to Rs. 3039	30843	15519	8302	2178	3102	803	406	96	172	24
7	Maximum of which ranges between Rs. 1400 to Rs. 2249	49752	26068	12677	3113	5339	1168	178	171	188	12
8	Maximum of which ranges between Rs. 0760 to Rs. 1399	182871	95560	37122	12223	22944	4731	3435	569	577	8
9	Maximum of which ranges between Rs. 640 to Rs. 759	34589	17833	4595	1879	6087	1887	935	168	425	16
10	Maximum of which, is Rs. 639 or less	9764	4442	867	759	2486	816	125	15	96	0
	Grand Total	337875	173699	72969	22191	42838	9971	5424	1027	1707	85
	Percentage Distribution	100.0%	51.4%	21.5%	6.5%	12.6%	2.9%	1.6%	3.0%	5.0%	2.0%
Source: Services Management Division dated September 1986.											

**TABLE 66: PROVINCE/REGIONWISE DOMICILE OF GOVERNMENT CIVIL SERVANTS
AS ON 1ST JANUARY, 1986**

Province/Regionwise break up									
BPS	Total	Punjab	Sindh (Urban)	Sindh (Rural)	NWFP	Baluchistan	Northern Areas and Tribal Areas	Azad Kashmir	No response
17-22	11,179	6,004	1,804	783	1,353	329	209	87	610
		53.70%	16.13%	7.00%	12.10%	2.96%	1.86%	0.79%	5.46%
16	6,473	3,660	1,268	338	671	183	45	28	280
		56.54%	19.58%	5.23%	10.36%	2.83%	0.69%	0.44%	4.33%
1-15	1,70,273	86,500	28,599	11,385	19,849	5,763	2,181	2,798	13,198
		50.80%	16.79%	6.68%	1.60%	3.38%	1.29%	1.65%	7.75%
TOTAL	1,87,925	96,164	31,671	12,506	21,873	6,275	2,435	2,913	14,088
		51.17%	16.85%	6.65%	11.65%	3.35%	1.29%	1.55%	7.49%

(Figures shown in Brackets are percentages of the total)

The diagrams 12-13 indicate that the largest number of officials are found among the youngest groups and there is descending pattern thereafter, We have not considered the below 20 years age group, as they would be largely composed of minors and hence unqualified persons.

A comparison of the age patterns among the Federal workforce in 1983 and 1986, shows a substantial change in wand curve. There were little increase in the age groups of 46 years and above in 1986 then there were in 1983 the respective being 27,935 (14.86%) and 20,086 (13.11%). The interesting statistics to observe here is that not only the proportional percentages increase but also the real totals.

Source: Federal Government Civil Servants
Census Report January 1986.
Services Management Division.

It shows that the Urban population as against its prescribed quota of 7.6% has 16.85% jobs in government offices and 21.5% in the autonomous/semi autonomous corporations in 1986 while rural population got only 6.65% and 6.5% jobs respectively against their prescribed quota of 11.4%. This does not reflect the latest position resulting from the new appointments made recently. Intelligentsia in Sindh also feel that real financial autonomy was never given to the provinces irrespective of the character of the regime. The center has always been controlling the financial strings and has been pressurizing the provinces in case the provincial government do not keep in line with the wishes of the center. They also complain that Sindh has been contributing more to the revenues of the central government as compared to the share in the funds which it has been receiving. While there are genuine apprehensions from other provinces over too much concentration of financial institutions in the province of Sindh, particularly

Karachi, the problem of economic and financial autonomy as visualized in the 1973 Constitutions remains unrealized.

The economic cost of this crisis is enormous.

V DEMOGRAPHIC FACTORS

There has been an unprecedented increase of population in Sindh due to a large scale influx of population from the other provinces and from Afghanistan. Besides this there has been illegal migration from India, Sri Lanka, Bangladesh, Burma, Iran, Iraq etc., whose number is reported to be around one million in Karachi alone. It has generated a widespread perception among the local population that they may be reduced to a minority Status In their own home province, which should not be allowed to happen. Already delicate ethnic balance between the Sindhis and the new-Sindhis, existing since the partition, appears to tilt towards the non-Sindhis now. This has led to an intensification of competition in terms of jobs between the Sindhis and the non-Sindhis in which the Sindhis find themselves at a disadvantage vis-à-vis more skilled ethnic groups. However, the people of Sindh are willing to share all that exists in Sindh with those who have made Sindh their permanent abode. Our vision of the future is that of an integrated society, all persons settled in Sindh taking pride in the place where they live and able to share their joys and sorrows as one family. Large scale influx of population has also brought several corresponding social problems adding to the complexity of the situation. It has aggravated the problem of cultural interaction with the local population, overstretched the existing civic amenities in the urban area resulting in the Inability of the administration to provide the population with adequate transport, water, sewerage, electricity, housing and gas facilities, and has also brought the problems associated with the emergence of drug-mafias, smuggling and proliferation of illegal weapons. The industrial policy of the Government, to restrict further expansion of Industry in Karachi, has aggravated this situation. Youth from both rural and urban areas, regard themselves as left-outs. While the push and pull factors are very much in operation, and the right of all citizens of Pakistan on all parts of the country is a cherished privilege, the economic policies of the respect. Governments have failed to respond to the challenge of balanced regional development, decentralization of developmental process, and equitable distribution of resources and fruits of growth.

VI ADMINISTRATIVE FACTORS

Corrupt, inefficient and out-moded administrative structure of Sindh Government is another very significant factor in keeping the pot boiling in the province.

The terrorists, murderers, dacoits and ordinary criminals usually enjoy the protection of local influential's in cities as well as rural areas against whom the district administration, if not hands in glove with then is either powerless or too fearful of bringing them to book. The corrupt structure of the police, especially at lower levels, is either in league with the criminals or is extra-ordinarily inefficient to get hold of them. Whatever may be the reasons, the criminals know how to get around law and a very large number of them apparently go unpunished.

Organizational structure of the Sindh police woefully lacks both in terms of sheer number of police force and quality of their training as well as modern weapons, communications and other, facilities to cope with the existing law and order situation. Moreover, there is a colossal waste of scare police personnel on the so called security/protocol arrangements for both the VVIPs and VIPs. It is in dire need of both qualitative and quantitative improvements.

The neglect of the questions of separation of executive from judiciary, of investigation and prosecuting roles of police and of administrative reforms to bring the district executive authority under the district elected authority have also worsened the situation.

Delay in justice and lack of sensitivity on the part of the administration in redressing the grievances of people give a partisan image to the administrative structure. This is a very significant factor in getting the issues politicized along ethnic lines and forcing the people to take the law into their own hands.

VII KARACHI FACTOR

So far we have discussed the factors which in our view have a bearing on the political and socio-economic scene of Sindh in the context of its ethnic realities. Karachi, however, has a significance of its own. It is not only the largest city of Pakistan, but is also, in a way, mini-Pakistan, reflecting all shades of what goes to make the spectrum of Pakistan. In fact, it has a personality of its own.

Karachi, over the years, has become a hot bed of problems. A city of 386,000 persons has grown into a metropolis claimed to be of 9-million in the short span of four decades. *Katchi Abbadis* have become a regular phenomenon, affecting almost one third of its population. It is estimated that 37 percent of the population of Karachi lives in about 400 slums or squatter settlements. In 1980 only 46% of the population had direct water connections in their households, some 45% had to rely on community water connections and the remaining 9% had no direct access to clean water.

Around 47 percent of the household lack connections with sewerage and drainage system. About 55 percent of the household do not have access to piped gas.

A large part of the woes of the people of Karachi are due to a transport system totally incapable of meeting the needs of the population. Lack of adequate educational facilities is also at the root of Karachi's problems. Almost half the boys and girls of school-going age are unable to get admission in schools. The situation persists at the college and university levels. Unrest amongst the youth has been aggravated by the deficiency of these facilities. The ethnic problem in the city has been complicated by the fact that certain trades are concentrated in, if not monopolized by, certain ethnic communities, While this term of division of labor may not be a rare phenomenon, in view of the ethnic tensions in the city, the realization of this has somewhat increased.

Karachi has more than a fair share of the vices that are common to big urban centers, that is, drug peddling, gun-running and other mafias. The common people feel insecure and unsafe. Robberies, abductions and other major crime have become routine matters and often go unchecked.

However, the grim situation of continuing ethnic violence since the past four years cannot adequately be explained only by pointing to above mentioned problems that are universal to all the 3rd World cities but do not necessarily lead to such long spates of extremely barbarous. violence. It seems imperative to look into the real causes rather than analyzing the mere symptoms.

It is not the intention, to side track the issue or to undermine the importance of finding solution to the civic problems. lack of facilities may not be the only explanation for the scale, the style, and the direction of violence.

To understand the present situation it is necessary to look back into not too distant history. The majority of immigration from the Muslim minority regions of India had settled mainly in Sindh and within Sindh the city of Karachi became their largest concentration. They soon became dominating factor in all sectors of economic activity. A study conducted by Pakistan Institute of Development Economics showed the following composition of Karachi's labour force in 1959. Latest data are not available.

TABLE					
Natives, Mohajirs and Migrants from the Rest of Pakistan in the Karachi Labour force, 1959.					
Occupational Group	Total	Natives	Migrants from Pakistan	Migrants from India	Immigrants from India as percent of total
All persons in Labor force.	537,900	87,125	146,100	329,250	57.40
Professionals and Technicians	14,775	225	2,250	10,250	69.40
Administrations and Managers	49,300	6,900	6,675	25,650	42.30
Skilled Laborers	92,125	7,225	23,000	49,475	64.50
Semi-Skilled and Unskilled.	114,150	188,000	45,675	45,300	39.70
Others	303,500	51,950	68,500	178,575	58.88
Source: G.M. Farooq, The People of Karachi: Economic Characteristics, KARACHI -1967.					

However with the passage of time people from other regions of Pakistan also began to join ranks. The shifting of the capital to Islamabad had also resulted in diminishing the political power of the immigrant. The rapid industrialization in the 1960's brought in its wake influx of large number of persons to meet the expanding needs of industry and other sectors of economy.

The expansion of education had begun to bring the locals into competition for jobs in the state sector as well as in the commercial sectors. This obviously had the impact of bringing down the relative sharp of other groups.

Unemployment, particularly of the educated youth, has become a serious problem in Karachi. The policy of the Government restricting establishment of new industry in Karachi among others have been cited as major causes of this situation. People of Karachi lack basic amenities like water, electricity, gas, sewerage, waste disposal, transport, roads and communication, including post offices and telephone, recreation facilities, education; and medical services. Police is rude and unsympathetic. Courts are over-crowded. Crimes are on the increase. There is no security of life and property. The citizen is deeply frustrated in his dealings with various government and semi-government agencies responsible for providing him with essential services. The administration is least concerned with the woes of the people. He feels he has been thrown to the wall. The society and the state are not willing to give him an opportunity to live a decent and an honorable life. This is the situation that alienates him from society and, paves the way for a culture of violence and destruction. According to a recent report:

"In the last six months, over a dozen industrialists or their family members have been kidnapped and over 35 million rupees in ransom money has been paid out.

Province-wide almost two hundred kidnapping cases have taken place in Sindh since the beginning of the year. Over 150 cases were documented from January to mid-June. There were 28 kidnappings in January, 15 in February, 14 in March, 35 in April and 44 in the first two weeks of June. So grave was the situation that the Federation of Pakistan Chamber of Commerce and Industry and All Pakistan Textile Mills Association and other business associations placed ads. in newspaper demanding that the Government take stern measures to protect the life and property of citizens."⁷

An indicator of the enormity of the problem is the fact that Adamjee Insurance is now offering ransome insurance. Between 500 to 600 businessmen are reported to have availed themselves of this facility.⁸

Karachi's development has been neglected for too long. The relationship between K.M.C. and K.D.A. remains unresolved. The dissolution of the Corporation in 1987 added to the problems of the city. The administrative set up remains incapable of coping with the enormous problems of this gigantic city. The ethnic problem cannot be examined in isolation of this problem-ridden context.

VIII EXTERNAL FACTORS

It is generally being said that external factors are also involved in further complicating the political situation in Sindh. However, this should not be allowed to become a way of evading the real issues at home.

It is true that an unspecified number of illegal immigrants from other Countries like India, Sri Lanka, Iraq, Iran, Burma, Bangladesh, and some African countries have settled in the urban areas of Sindh. Many of them have been associated with narcotics, weapons, smuggling and other illegal activities. They have created mafias, who in collaboration with the corrupt administration structure of the provincial and federal governments, operate freely.

In a country like ours it cannot be ruled out that some external governments and international agencies may have a finger in the pie. This is an issue that deserves more systematic probe and serious investigations before any specific conclusion would be drawn.

However, we would like to emphasize that any external interest could only succeed in benefitting from our weaknesses if we failed to put our own house in order.

⁷ *Newsline*, Karachi, August 1989, p 26.

⁸ *Ibid* p 27.

Some sections of the Hindu community in Sindh have also been actively involved in promoting the regionalist causes. They apparently maintain their contacts both with the Sindhi Hindus in India and with the Indian secret agencies. There is little hard evidence of direct involvement of the Indian Government, however, circumstantial evidence seem to suggest by possible support to the extremist components of various ethnic groups. A top ranking leader has himself declared that he did contact India, United States and Russia for help in seeking what he calls liberation of Sindh although, he observes, they did not respond positively.⁹

A Sindhi scholar, Musa Bhutto, has discussed the links of certain separatist groups with the Sindhi Hindus in India. Many of the books used by these groups in Sindh were published in the Sindhi printing presses of Bombay (India). Some of the Hindus living in Sindh, played an important role in supporting these activities.¹⁰ Indian magazine *Naeen Duniya* has been advocating the cause of Sindhudesh.¹¹ Similarly, another Bombay magazine, *Sindhudhara* is devoted to the same cause.¹²

An All-India Sindh Azad Council was established in India, in October, 1986. One of its objectives is to seek liberation, of Sindh.¹³ It has also been reported that Mrs. Indra Gandhi took personal interest in the activities of the Sindhi nationalists working in India.

⁹ Extracts from the interview:

Q. What were the reasons for the formation of Jiye-Sindh?

A. The reason was the continuous struggle to get the rights of Sindh accepted by the authorities. When they were neglecting we went on escalating our demands. When Gandhiji and the others began their struggle, they wanted home rule and self Government. Finally the question of the freedom and Independence of India became their main demand. In the same way, we demanded some of our rights. When we were neglected and our separate nationhood was not recognized, we retaliated. We said Sindhis were a separate nation. We insisted that we have a separate culture. We were not given proper rights. So we demanded the rights of self determination. So from the idea of *Jiye Sindh*, we have reached the conclusion that without the breaking up of Pakistan and the formation of Sindh as an Independent country and a member of the United Nations, no other solution is possible. Our poet, Munshi Ibrahim says: "There is no other way to go without the fight, let us fight for our freedom."

Q. Do you envisage that any foreign power would help the establishment of this state of yours, or will it be an indigenous movement or both?

A. We are seeking foreign help for our independence. So far we have failed. I went to Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, he did not give me any support. We tried the Russians, but we did not get any help. We even tried to get Some sympathy from Afghanistan and from the Americans, but neither helped us. At present we stand alone. But anything is possible. For instance, by one sudden act of God, a powerful man like Zia disappeared in a few minutes."

Herald, Monthly, Karachi, August, 1989

¹⁰ Muhammad Musa Bhutto, *Babul Islam Sindh Kay Halat Ka Belag Jaiza*, Urdu, Hyderabad, 1977. p.76.

¹¹ *Naeen Duniya*, March, 1967.

¹² See particularly issue of *Naeen Duniya* for May, 1968.

¹³ *Indian Express*, Bombay, 8th Oct, 1968.

Another dangerous scenario relates to the vicious efforts on the part of certain other groups to create conditions that may result in the division of Sindh. commentator on national affairs has surmised about a possible role of the super powers in this game:

"The possible role and interests of super powers is difficult to guess at this stage. But viewed in the context of Hong Kong passing over to the Chinese in 1997, a new Hong Kong in Karachi, controlled by friendly forces, may not be a total fantasy for the West. Its strategic location being in the centre of South Asia and in close proximity to troubled Middle East, overlooking the oil producing gulf, Karachi could provide a better alternative even for military-cum-strategic reasons in addition to financial and economic ones."¹⁴

It cannot be ruled out that some external government and international agencies have a finger in the pie. This is an issue that deserves more systematic probe and serious investigations.

¹⁴ Shaheen Sahebi, "The Great Divide" *Globe*, Karachi, Vol. 2, Nos. 5 & 6 (May-June 1989), p. 13.

Chapter 4

WHAT SHOULD BE DONE: THE STRATEGY

Now we address ourselves to the crucial question:

What should be done? We propose to cover this part of our report in two chapters. First we shall deal with what in our opinion constitutes the appropriate strategy to overcome this multi-dimensional crisis. In the next chapter an effort would be made to identify some of the issues and to make certain recommendations to meet the situation.

Secular Nation State Model

We would like to state in very clear terms that the secular nation-state models have failed to solve the problems generated by multiplicity of cultures, nationalities and ethnic diversities. Nationalism, symbolizing the feeling of belonging to a group distinct from others because of some common racial, linguistic, ethnic and/or historical ties, and, usually, identified with a particular territory, has been a powerful force for consolidation as well as disintegration, particularly, during the last two centuries. The break-up of the Hapsburg and Ottoman empires in the nineteenth century and the liquidation of British, French, Italian and Spanish colonial empires in the twentieth century bear witness to the consolidating as well as the disintegrating roles of the principle of nationality.

A contemporary historian sums up the dilemma when he says:

"The rise of nationalism has stimulated the crystallization of ethnicity in many parts of the world. Nationalism is the claim of ethnic groups to self-determination. When an ethnic group achieves sovereignty in a certain state, it will become a nation which then excludes the other ethnic groups. The excluded ethnic groups are then forced to get organized and to seek a national minority status and an ethnic autonomy."¹⁵

The process of consolidation and disintegration keeps on multiplying. like the ever-emerging heads of the hydra. Political maps are made and re-made to suit this ever-changing scenario. Political stability remains an illusion, perhaps a period of calm between a series of storms, or a kind of a breathing space of truce between unending spells or wars. Problems faced by ethnic groups and cultural minorities between the two wars of this century were graphically portrayed in the debates, discussions and memoranda presented to the League of Nations, particularly to its Minorities

¹⁵ A.D. Smith, *The Ethnic Revival*, Cambridge, 1981.

Committee. Prof. C.A. Macartney, an English authority International Law and Secretary to the Minorities Committee of the League of Nations, has preserved a pathetic record of this period of the in his book, "*National States history of Europe and America National Minorities*". The intriguing, albeit eye-opening, conclusion to which Prof. Macartney was forced by this evidence deserves to be noted:

"A national state and national minorities are incompatibles. Where fate has put a nationality conscious minority in a state, there are only three possible solutions, and (although few governments between this) forcible nationalization is not one of them. Perhaps a fourth should be counted physical slaughter; but although this most effective of all remedies is still in vogue in certain countries, it shall not be discussed here. The three possibilities which can be considered are: either the theoretical basis of existing population may be left untouched but frontiers may be revised in such a way as to leave alien elements outside them; or the basis of the state may be retained, and its frontiers left intact, but the minorities may be eliminated by emigration, perhaps through exchange of population; or thirdly, restricting population and frontiers may be retained, but the basis of the state may be altered."¹⁶

This is the dilemma of a secular nation-state. The hydra-headed problem is not confined to the countries of Europe; the fate of Africa and Asia is no different. Those who look towards India in search of a solution may reflect not only upon the fate of the 150 million Muslims but also of the Sikhs, the Nagas, the Mizos, the Gurkhas, the Maharashtrians, the Dravidians and who not?

Socialist Model

Socialist revolution tried to change the basis of the state and claimed a permanent solution to the problem of ethnic minorities. There was some degree of calm as long as the state machinery was overtly authoritarian and tried to seek refuge behind the iron curtain. Once the curtain was drawn, the problem reemerged. Russia and the socialist states of East Europe are plagued by ethnic, regional, linguistic, religious and cultural minorities. What is happening today in Kazakhstan, Estonia, Azerbaijan in the Soviet Union, in Bulgaria, Romania, Hungary and Yugoslavia in Eastern Europe is a reminder that the problem of ethno- nationalism remains unsolved despite the socialist or secular democratic political frameworks, which may otherwise have many other achievements to their credit. *The Economist* (Sept. 17, 1988, p. 57) succinctly observes that "a spectre is haunting the communist half of Europe one that communism thought it had laid to rest, the passions of nationalism, whether it comes from Estonians (0.4% of the Soviet Union population) or Serbs (36% of Yugoslavs) the challenge is severe." But the spectre is not haunting the communist half of Europe alone it is haunting the whole of Europe and

¹⁶ C.A. Macartney, *National States and National Minorities*.

the Western World. It is also haunting all those countries which have pursued the strategy of following the secular nation-state model or the socialist model. Unfortunately, it is also haunting Pakistan today because despite our lip-service to Islam, we too have essentially followed the secular nation-state strategy and have failed to learn from the tremulous experience of 1971 - the bifurcation of Pakistan.

The question is: then what? Let us try to reflect upon the strategy that Islam provides to face this challenge.

Islamic Strategy

Islam had adopted a unique approach to the solution of this problem. It provides a new basis for the organization of human society and an equity- based framework for the flourishing of a united yet diversified and genuinely pluralistic society. It establishes its social organization on a faith and ideology that is universal and open to all, ensuring equal opportunities for attaining the most sublime, morally, spiritually and materially and is also tolerant enough to accept those who refuse to join its ideological fold. Within the Islamic community and between the Islamic community and other communities and nationalities it refuses to impose a strategy of forced similarity. Instead, it pursues the path of unity in diversity, equality alongside acceptances of differences as genuine and authentic, loyalty to a higher ideal, yet acceptance of regional variations and regional concerns.

Tawhid (the principle of Oneness of God) is the bedrock of the Islamic social order. It affirms that all men are creatures of One God they are all equal and subject to the same laws of spiritual and social development. Distinctions of color, class, race, language and territory, real as they are are good only for knowing each other, and not as the basis for social identification and the criteria for excellence for excellence moral or material. Humanity is one single family of God, all men and women belong to one fraternity, they are respectable as humans. And excellence lies in achieving heights of virtue, piety, God-consciousness and service mankind in a frame-work of freedom and competition where all have equal opportunities for seeking the most sublimes. The Quran says in categorical terms that:

"... men' Behold, we have created you all out of a male and a female, and have made you into nations and tribes, so that you might come to know one another. Verily the noblest of you in the sight of God is the one who is the most deeply conscious and heedful of Him. Behold, God is all-knowing, all -Aware."¹⁷

This is the first charter of human equality. All human beings are like one family, without any inherent superiority of one over another based on race, blood, color,

¹⁷ *Al-Quran*: 49:13.

ethnicity or otherwise. Islam emphasizes the essential oneness of human beings underlying their apparent differentiations with the result that while differences are not ignored, racial, tribal, national or linguistic prejudice is avoided. In fact, boastings and claims of superiority based on national or tribal prejudice (*asabiyyah*) have been condemned by the prophet (peace be upon him) as "pagan ignorance" (*Jahiliyyah*). The prophet said: "Man is but a God-conscious believer or an unfortunate sinner. All people are children of Adam, and Adam was made out of clay."¹⁸ The Prophet (peace be upon him) is also reported to have said: "He is not of us who proclaims the cause of tribal partisanship (*assabiyyah*); and he is not of us who fights in the cause of tribal partisanship."¹⁹ When asked to explain tribal partisanship (*assabiyyah*) the Prophet answered, "It means helping their own people in an unjust cause."²⁰ On the occasion of his last pilgrimage the Prophet (peace be upon him) declared:

"Your blood and your property are sacrosanct until you meet your Lord and He will ask you of your deeds know that every Muslims is another Muslims' brother and that the Muslims are brethren unto each other. It is only lawful to take from a brother what he gives you willingly, so wrong not yourselves."²¹

Islam does not deny differences based on language, ethnicity, culture, race or color. Instead it accepts and accommodates them under the umbrella of a higher principle of identification and social organization based on faith and moral excellence; with the result that a universal basis is provided for societal organization and a moral path opened up for human evolution. Islam does not stand for an artificial uniformity, it affirms the principle of unity in diversity - a unity based on a common ideal, an agreed criterion for moral vice or virtue and equity, a law that ensures equality and justice and a social organization that admits of variety within the framework. of a common fraternity. Iqbal sums up this strategy of Islam when he says:

"Islam is not earth-bound. It aims at shaping a human society by the co-mingling of race and nationalities so that an Ummah with a specific self-consciousness may emerge."²²

The Islamic model ensures justice for all, those who join the fold of Islam and become part of the Islamic Ummah, and also for those who remain outside its fold, and as such are, accepted as part of a wider family of nations or religions and cultural communities. Whether we look to the regional and ethnic diversity, that existed within the integrated mosaic of the Muslim community, or wider matrix of the Islamic state ensuring equality before law and religio-cultural plurality to non-Muslim communities living within the

¹⁸ Reported by Tirmidi and Abdu Da'ud, on the authority of Abu Hurayrah.

¹⁹ Reported by Abu Da'ud, on the authority of Jubayr Bin Mutim.

²⁰ Reported by Abe Da'ud, on the authority of wathileh Ibn Al-Asqa.

²¹ Ibn Ishaq: Sirat Rasul Allah.

²² See: Sayed Nazir Niazi, *Iqbal Kay Huzur*, p 150.

Islamic realm, we are struck by the unique approach adopted by Islam in maintaining unity without eliminating diversity, oneness without ignoring regional variations, ideological solidarity with cultural and linguistic plurality, supremacy of the Shariah with justice for all and in all realms. This is what Islam stands for. We have never tried to sincerely and persistently pursue this strategy. It is not Islam that has failed in Pakistan; it is politics that has failed and failed because it never followed the strategy laid down by Islam.

The crisis in Sindh has exposed all and sundry to the gruesome realities. We are not left with much choice. We are not left with much time. The choice is between life and death, between salvation and suicide. The elite have failed the masses. The leadership has betrayed the people. Let us go back to the people. Let us go back to the goodness in their souls, the spark in their faith, the throb in their hearts, and the still unextinguished hope for life with honor.

IS SECESSION THE ANSWER? No, it is a recipe for death or servitude. The experience of Bangladesh during the last two decades also deserves to be examined with cool logic. It was claimed that West Pakistan was exploiting East Pakistan and with separation rivers of milk and honey would begin to flow into all corners of Bangladesh. Today its economic problems are ten times more grave and it has moved from lower middle group of developing countries in 1971 to the poorest of the poor in 1980's. It was also alleged that too much is being spent on defence budget in Pakistan, but with a lean defence budget Bangladesh could not record any economic miracle. It was claimed that the people of Bengal are fed up with military rule, but Bangladesh continues to be ruled by the Army or by semi-military regimes. It was hoped that India would secure for the people of Bengal freedom and honor, but freedom and honor both remain threatened from Indian hegemony, here was clamor against Purbjahi domination, but the realities of Brahman colonialism and the ravages released from Farrakha barrage have turned hopes into dupes. The strategy of secession is doomed.

IS SOCIALISM THE ANSWER? No: The failure of the socialist experience should also be an eye-opener. It fails to provide a spectrum within which many color can flourish. Its record on the score of human rights and respect for democratic values is dismal. Its economic programme has proved a mirage. It has failed to provide any safeguard against exploitation and corruption. It is today disintegrating in its citadels Russia, Poland, Czechoslovakia. Hungary. East Germany, etc. It bears no promise for the future.

IS VIOLENCE AND BLOOD-BATH THE ANSWER? No, it can only lead to more blood-bath, more destruction and self-annihilation. Brutal killings, mass assassinations, decoities, kidnappings and ransoms may satisfy vanity for a while. They have a tendency to rebound and destroy all and sundry. Such revolutions eat up their own children and turn countries into ashes.

IS DIVISION OF THE PROVINCE ON ETHNIC/LINGUISTIC LINES THE ANSWER? No. It will only pave the way for further rivalries within each part, leading to further splits, further acrimonies, further violence, further divisions. Unity is the path to strength; division a stepping stone for diminution and destruction.

ARE MINI-LINGUISTIC STATES THE ANSWER? No. It has not worked in India, Russia, Yugoslavia, or anywhere else.

THEN WHAT IS THE ANSWER? The answer lies in the revival of the spirit of the Pakistan movement, in the realization that we have no option but to live with each, understand each other, forget and forgive mistakes of the past and resolve to build a new future on the basis of Islam and respect for the rights and needs of all, on the basis of a system that ensures justice to everyone and every community, on the acceptance of the reality of plurality and tolerance for differences, on building a framework ensuring participation of all in decision-making and on judicious mobilization of nations' resources and on their equitable distribution. It calls for a concern for oneself and for others. All Pakistanis, living in Sindh, and for that matter in any other part of Pakistan, are a source of strength to each other. The attitude of Sindhis standing for Sindhi rights, Pukhtuns for the rights of Pukhtuns, Punjabis for the rights of Punjabis, Baluchs for the rights of the Baluchs, Mohajirs for the rights of the Mohajirs has to be shunned. We must take the initiative to demonstrate that pursuit of individual or group rights should be made with concern for the rights of all. Violation of the legitimate rights of anyone, whoever that be, means the violation of the rights of all and protection of the rights of one should ensure the protection of the rights of all. Emphasis on "I" is welcome, but it should be a stepping stone to the realization of "We" and "We all". When Shah Ablul Latif Bhitai prayed for blessing on Sindh, he also prayed for the welfare of all.

Kareen mathan Sindh Sukhar alam Subh abad Kareen".

ڪرين مٿان سنڌ سڪاد
عالم سڀ آباد ڪرين

This is the road to life, honor and prosperity. This is the road to sanity. Our thorough investigations into the problems of Sindh and our direct contact with the people at all levels has given us the confidence to say that the common people of Sindh are committed to Pakistan and seek their destiny within the framework of Pakistan. They are also committed to the democratic process and the establishment of just Islamic social order. Extremism has to be eliminated. The mainstream wants a strong Pakistan and a prosperous Sindh, along with prosperity in all parts of Pakistan.

In the light of this strategy those who stand for secession and separate statehood have to be treated differently; yet we hope they too might have been pushed to that extreme because of neglect or mal-treatment. He should try to salvage them.

Those who are acting at the behest of external forces have to be isolated and exposed. There cannot be and there should not be any tolerance towards those who are prepared to play in the hands of the enemy.

Those who have been victims of an identity crisis, and are trying to seek identity in a smaller group by redefining their concept of community in the light of these new social trends, to the neglect of the wider reality, deserve to be approached differently. New confidence must be inspired in them that Islamic identity and national solidarity represent a mosaic in which all smaller identities co-exist. We must develop a dialogue with them. Their rights must be ensured. They must feel they are part of the mainstream. this is the only way barriers can disappear and bridges can be built. Ideology is not mere words; it means a fresh approach and an effective programme to face all these challenges. This is the strategy that can deliver the goods.

WHAT SHOULD BE DONE? ISSUES AND RECOMMENDATIONS.

IMMEDIATE MEASURES

1. First and foremost is the question of restoration of law and order in the province. The fast deteriorating law and order situation must be checked with a firm hand and with uncompromising integrity. To begin with, there must be unflinching resolve to enforce the rule of law, on all whatever be their political, ethnic and linguistic affiliations. It is necessary to ensure that basic principle of law, namely that everyone is equal before law without any discrimination, is strictly enforced.

Unfortunately respect for law in the society is today at the lowest

2. It is recommended that effective steps should be taken to inculcate and promote respect for law at all levels. In this connection the government, the political parties, social organizations, religious leaders and all individuals fulfill their duty to the nations.

3. The role of the press and the media facing this challenging situation cannot be over-emphasized. The Committee strongly feels that publication of substantiated reports in emotive terms cannot help extinguishing the fires of hatred and suspicion, in fact they add fuel to fire. The press and media wield great power and influence, which must be harnessed for promoting amity, friendship and brotherhood. The responsibility of the press towards articulating the real grievances of the people and acting as the watchmen of society is not in any way under-emphasized, yet in the face of the grim situation that the province faces, it is the duty of the national and local press to act with great responsibility and to be catalysts for restoring confidence and fellow-feeling of different sectors of the society. Radio and T.V. have a very unique role to play in this respect. There are thousand and one ways in which they can strive to create a new climate of amity in the society. The Committee very strongly recommends responsible citizens' participation in suggesting concrete programmes for the media in this respect. An all out effort on the part of public leaders, as suggested in para 2 above, and of the press and the media is bound to have a salutary effect on the situation.

4. Creation of a vastly improved modern police force in Sindh is absolutely vital in handling the current situation of lawlessness. The existing police structure in Sindh must undergo both qualitative and quantitative transformation immediately. In this

case, the number of police force, recruited of experienced, qualified and honest personnel in senior positions, adequate training facilities, criteria of merit and efficiency, modern weapons, equipments and means of communications are vital components of such reorganization. The policy of recruiting police from local population, having direct knowledge of the area and familiarity with the language and customs of the people, should be encouraged. As far as possible local people be placed incharge of respective police stations. The committee also feels that specification of appropriate educational qualifications for recruitment. In police at different levels must be prescribed and its enforcement ensured. The policy of ad hoc appointments mainly on political considerations is fatal to the future of law and order in the country. In addition character verification prior to recruitment in police must be ensured.

5. The committee strongly feels that while the police must be professionally competent and financially well-rewarded, it must also be made to shoulder responsibility for their respective areas. Incentives and reward-system should be correlated to the fulfillment of these principles of police responsibility. As such, police officers at tiers from A.S.I., to S.P. level, must be held responsible for crimes in their areas of responsibility, and wherever the number of undetected crimes exceeds the number to be specified in this regard, suitable punishment, including major penalties, be accorded to the defaulting police officials. It has been quite often noted that the concerned police officials do not register FIRs even in cognizable cases, though obligatory in law. In order to overcome this mal-practice it is suggested that if an applicant hands over a complaint in writing to the public representatives of his area, with a copy to the SDM/Ilaqa magistrate of the area, such written complaint should be entertained by the police authorities and registered as an FIR. In such a case the magistrate concerned shall ensure that cognizance is taken of the said offence. This procedure should be widely publicized.

6. The Committee is of the considered opinion that the command-order and related administrative mechanisms relating to security arrangements deserve to be determined. The District Magistrate should act as the effective administrative head of the district and police should be placed directly under his control as was the original position. Dilution of command-order and duplicity of authorities lie at the root of some of the major weaknesses of administration.

7. The Committee also notes with concern the lack of proper coordination between different agencies, responsible for the maintenance of law and order. At present there are a number of auxiliary forces, for example, Indus Rangers, Frontier Constabulary, Sindh Forces, Hur Mujahids, etc., operating in the province in addition to Police, all working under separate commands. The district administration has no control over any of these auxiliary agencies, who seek instructions from their respective commanders. This is causing great confusion, particularly at moments of emergency. It is, therefore,

recommended that there should be greater and effective coordination between these forces under the control of the respective district administrations.

8. The committee is of the considered view that the political use of the criminal procedure code has played an important role in the escalation of crime and violence in the province. The committee, therefore, recommends that:-

The people accused of criminal activities must not be released on the basis of political considerations under any circumstances.

9. They also provide youth with the all important opportunity to prepare for a more effective role in the later life. In addition, in the form of union elections, the youth get their first exposure to electoral process. It is, therefore, recommended that all college and university unions should be forthwith restored and regular elections be held to make them an effective organ for healthy curricular activities.

10. It is noted with regret that the educational institutions and their hostels have become arsenals as well as centers for criminal activities; this must be firmly checked. The use of hostels and educational institutions for acts of violence or their use by the out-side elements must not be tolerated in any form. To check this, the institution of warden must be strengthened and strict vigilance and control must be exercised on outsiders using college and university hostels for non-academic purposes.

11. Autonomy of the university and educational institutions should be restored. Both the vice chancellors and principals should be given adequate power to control all aspects of university and college life. The academic community should take care of its own affairs, without outside influence, and ensure establishment of healthy traditions of teaching, research and training. Only men of integrity and high academic and administrative experience be appointed as vice chancellors and heads of educational institutions.

12. The Government should give fullest support to expansion of education and make available necessary resources to the educational institutions. The Government and all political parties must realize that the autonomy and sanctity of educational institutions must be respected and the educational institutions in general and students, in particular, must not be used for political purposes.

13. Extra-curricular activities, particularly sports, debates, Islamically oriented cultural programmes, etc., should be substantially encouraged in all educational institutions.

14. Effective steps should be taken for the ideological and moral training of students at all level of education. In this respect teaching of individual and social ethics, dynamics of human relations, history of Pakistan Movement and lives of great and noble men of our history should Occupy distinguished place in the curricula.
15. Compulsory military training should be introduced in all the educational institutions.
16. The Committee strongly recommends transfer of huge resources to education to bring about its quantitative expansion as well as qualitative transformation, ensuring educational facilities to all who seek education and skills, without disturbing, for the time being, the quota system. Special emphasis be laid on polytechnics and institutions which could enable young educated unemployed to acquire skills for which jobs are available in the country and abroad.
17. Social Committees, composed of leaders of main ethnic groups living in a particular locality, must be formed. These committees should take up the responsibility to maintaining law and order and keeping a strict vigil on anti-social elements in their respective localities. The idea of collective responsibility and collective accountability be promoted.
18. All illegal foreign immigrants must be rounded up and deported forthwith.
19. In case of Afghan refugees special policy would have to be devised ensuring that they are made to live in their own colonies.
20. There should be a thorough crack-down on all drug-mafias, narcotic dealers, smugglers, including their supporters in the bureaucracy and higher positions, political or otherwise.
21. Severe shortages in the civic amenities in the main urban areas of Sindh particularly Karachi pose a special problem. Facilities such as education, transport, sewerage system, water supply, electricity, gas and others should be met on an emergency footing besides the long- term comprehensive planning for provision of these amenities in all' parts of the province.
22. In view of the fact that Karachi is a metropolitan city having people from all parts of Pakistan and in view of the fact that the shortage of civic amenities in the city have reached a crisis situation. it is strongly recommended that a special fund, for the provision of these facilities, should be created and the Federal Government should make necessary financial resources available on high priority basis for this fund. International aid agencies may also be contacted in this respect.

23. There must be a consensus between the government and the opposition to uphold genuinely democratic principles in their mutual dealings, respect for provincial autonomy as provided in 1973 Constitution, both in letter and spirit, and an agreement on the maintenance of a climate of political amity and harmony.

LONG TERM PROGRAMME

24. Long-term planning must be done as to how to restructure the civil service and armed forces so as to make them truly representative of the nation by diversifying their recruitment base. This is an area where fundamental changes must be ensured.

25. Balanced regional economic planning must be devised with due regard to the regional considerations. Flow of manpower from rural areas to urban must be checked by, among others, spreading industrialization the rural areas, by creating adequate infrastructural facilities and by giving special incentives to the private investors in the rural areas, taking special care of remote areas.

26. Grievances of Sindhi peasants must be redressed in terms of giving them state lands and other necessary facilities. It is never too late to redress a long term injustice. Policy in respect of allotment and re-allocation of land must be overhauled to ensure respectable living, first to those who are nearest to the land, and then for all those who are capable of making optimal contribution to economic and social welfare of the country.

27. Comprehensive urban planning and its frequent periodic review is essential to meet the legitimate complaints of urban citizens with regard to transport, education, housing, water, electricity, gas and other civic amenities. Recommendations of Masud Zaman Commission, would be relevant in this regards. In this respect immediate steps be taken to examine the possibilities of introducing over-head mono-rail system of transport in Karachi in the light of the experiences in Sydney, Tokyo and other cities. Effective solution of the transport problem deserves to be given top priority.

28. Conscious socio-economic policies must be devised to reduce the large scale influx of population into Sindh by providing economic opportunities to areas from where migration of population is most significant, comprehensive study must be undertaken to examine the demographic situation in the context of economic opportunities in detail and options to reduce that pressure and provide local opportunities spelled out.

29. Administrative structure of Sindh Government must be reorganized thoroughly and completely. Corrupt officials should be screened out and criteria of merit and efficiency should be strictly observed in all cases. Incentives should be provided for efficiency, integrity and meritorious service. Pay structure of the civil services should be

revised to enable them to live a reasonably comfortable life. Strict vigil should be exercised on all officials living beyond their means, irrespective of their status.

30. In Sindh both Urdu and Sindhis should be taught in all educational institutions and used as the official languages. Enough resources should be mobilized for the development of both at all levels and in all departments of public life. Efforts must be made that every child studying in Sindh and every official serving in the province is in a position to understand and speak both these languages.

31. Equal rights of all persons settled in Sindh must be acknowledged and observed. There cannot be barriers on migration within one country but a national policy must be developed with a view to:

(a) seek the development of those areas from where emigration is most pronounced as envisaged in the special development plan;

(b) develop a system of national grants for the special development of areas in which people have come from different parts of the country. In this respect Karachi needs a special budget and a special place in the development plans of the province and the country.

32. The problem of distribution of water, keeping in view all the sources of water, rainfall, rivers and sub-soil, must be resolved at the national level in a manner that is judicious and equitable. In the light of all the reports and documents relevant to this issues, the Council of Common Interests should settle this matter once for all.

33. National Finance Commission should decide, without any delay, the question, not only of allocation of financial resources between the federation and the provinces but of actual devolution of powers of taxation and revenue-collection in a manner that guarantees reasonable financial autonomy to the provinces. This will produce greater financial discipline and local accountability and pave the way for regional development.

34. The planning machinery in the country also deserves to be decentralized. Presently primary emphasis is on planning at the top, primarily on a horizontal level. What is needed is development of a vertical mechanism for planning, wherein initiative emanates from the grass-root, implemented at the district level, coordinated at the provincial level, and integrated in the national plan at the level of the Federal Government. Absence of such vertical mechanism has resulted in over-centralization in planning and has produced lop-sidedness in planning priorities.

35. There is need to examine the question of decentralization of a number of national institutions like PICIC, WAPDA, IDBP, ADBP, all the financial institutions, etc., at least

through the immediate establishment of Provincial Boards having due public representation with well-defined functions and powers to make decision upto a certain agreed level. Establishment of new institutions must be done in a manner that every province and region may have equitable share of its head offices central operations.

36. Development of infra-structure facilities in the interior of Sindh as well as in Karachi deserves priority. Karachi's water, gas and electricity needs must be fulfilled through development of a master plan, which may also include solution to the problems of sanitation, sewerage, waste disposal, etc. Similarly, a plan for the development of an efficient transport system for Karachi is urgently needed. In this respect certain critical pulley decisions are needed, for example, the role of private/public sector in transportation, the choice of technology and modes of transport. The Committee found that a majority of witnesses, that appeared before it, favored privatization of transport and change of laws that regulate fares and routes, providing for greater freedom to market forces to take care of the needs of the people without eliminating the role of the public sector as a safety cushion. The committee also suggests that the transport be treated as industry with appropriate incentive in the form of reduction in custom duty, loans on easier terms, etc. Simultaneous induction of air-conditioned and more comfortable buses and coasters may ease the transport problem.

37. A master plan for the development of housing in the province, particularly low cost projects in Karachi, is needed. Similarly, development of villages in and around the city of Karachi, including the provision of civic facilities, be given priority. This problem has to be tackled on an emergency basis.

38. The role of Senate in ensuring genuine provincial autonomy within the framework of the Federation is immense. Senate has taken a very important initiative by establishing a Standing Committee on the Less-developed Areas. The present committee on the situation in Sindh is yet another initiative of the Senate. The Senate may examine the possibilities of establishing a Permanent Committee on National Integration, which may, on a regular basis, examine the problems and challenges relating to national integration, study special situation, as and when they arise, in any part of the country and may engage itself in a permanent in dialogue with persons and organizations that can play some role consolidating national integration and checking threats to it. The Committee may also act as a vigilante on trends obtaining in the country affecting various aspects of national integration. It can also undertake follow up action in respect of the recommendations of present report.

APPENDIX

1. Terms of Reference
2. Persons interviewed
 - Full name.
 - Position
 - Date on which interviewed.
 - Place where interviewed.
3. List of documents, Memoranda, Papers presented.
4. Travel schedule of the Committee.
5. Public opinion.

ANNEXURE I

TERMS OF REFERENCE OF THE SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON SITUATION IN SINDH.

- 1) Study the socio-politico situation in Sindh.
- 2) Analyze the Nature of the prevalent unrest and the general worsening of the law and order situation in the Province, manifesting itself in periodic incidents of large scale rioting, arson and violence, particularly in the urban centers.
- 3) Identify the underlying causes of the prevalent. state of affairs and the factors which feed and keep the social tensions alive.
- 4) Hold consultations with leaders of all shades of public opinion and political leanings in the Province and ascertain their views and suggestions, as also solicit their help and cooperation in establishing peaceful conditions on an enduring basis.
- 5) Meet other prominent citizens and administrative authorities both at the Provincial and local levels exploring with their help public grievances and local problems of general importance and seeking their views on how best to resolve them.

ANNEXURE II

PERSONS INTERVIEWED BY THE SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON THE SITUATION IN SINDH.

NAME	OCCUPATION/DESIGNATION	DATE	PLACE
1. Gen. (Retd). Rahim-ud-Din Khan	Ex-Governor Sindh	29-08-88	Governor House, Karachi
2. Mr. Akhtar Ali G. Qazi	Ex-Senior Minister of Sindh	29-08-88	Governor House
3. Syed Ghous Ali Shah	Ex-Chief Minister of Sindh	29-08-88	Karachi
4. Mir Sher Baz Khan Mazari	Political Leader	30-08-08	Karachi
5. Group of leaders of the Pakistan Peoples Party; namely:-			
i) Syed Qaim Ali Shah	Political Leaders	30-08-88	70-Clifton, Karachi
ii) Mr. N.D. Khan			
iii) Dr. Mrs. Asharaf Abbasi			
iv) Mr. Amin Faheem			
v) Mr. Hafeez Lakho			
vi) Dr. Tariq Sohail			
vii) Mr. P.K. Shahani			
viii) Mr. Aftab Shabbir Mirani			
6. Mr. Hussain Abdullah Haroon	Ex-Speaker of Sindh Assembly	21-09-88	Karachi
7. Mr. Altaf Hussain	Leader of MQM	22-09-88	Karachi
8. Syed Salim Abbas Gilani	Chief Secretary Sindh	22-09-88	Karachi
9. Senator Syed Mazhar Ali	Senator	23-09-88	Karachi
10. Mr. G.M. Syed	Political Leader	24-09-88	Sann
11. Delegation of Notables of Dadu city	Ex-MNA's Lawyers, Councilors and Businessmen	24-09-88	Dadu.
12. Mr. Abdul Hamid Jatoi	Ex-MNA	24-09-88	Village Betto, Dadu
13. Vice Chancellor Sindh University Jamshoro	Vice Chancellor	25-09-88	Jamshoro
14. Vice Chancellor Mehran Engineering University Jamshoro	Vice Chancellor	25-09-88	Jamshoro
15. Vice Chancellor Agriculture University, Tando Jam	Vice Chancellor	25-09-88	Jamshoro
16. Principal Liaquat Medical College, Hyderabad	Principal	25-09-88	Jamshoro
17. Delegation of Hyderabad Municipal Corporation led by Deputy Mayor including MQM.	Municipal Corporation	25-09-88	Hyderabad
18. Delegation of District Council, led by Chairman District Council	District Council	25-09-88	Hyderabad
19			
Delegation of Sindh National Alliance (SNA) led by Mr. Shah M. Shah	Political Leaders	25-09-88	Hyderabad.
20. Delegation of District Bar association, Hyderabad	Lawyers	25-09-88	Hyderabad
21. Delegation of Lawyers Sindh High Court Hyderabad	Lawyers	25-09-88	Hyderabad
22. Delegation of Doctor's of Liaquat Medical College, Hyderabad	Doctor's	26-09-88	Hyderabad
23. Delegation of notables of kotri, Hyderabad	Citizens	26-09-88	Hyderabad
24. Delegation of Principals of Hyderabad Colleges	Educationist	26-09-88	Hyderabad
25. Delegation of Hyderabad Chamber of Commerce, Hyderabad	Chamber of Commerce	26-09-08	Hyderabad
26. Delegation of Sindh Chamber of Agriculture, Hyderabad	Chamber of Agriculture	26-09-88	Hyderabad.
27. Delegation of notables of Hyderabad comprising:-			
i) Nawab Yamin Khan	Ex-MNA.	26-09-88	Hyderabad
ii) Mian Muhammad Shoukat	Leader of Jamaat-e-Islami		
iii) Abdul Majid Khanzada	Advocate		
28. Administration of Hyderabad Division	Commissioner. DIG, DCs,	26-09-88	Hyderabad.
29. Group of Panjabi Settlers		26-09-88	Hyderabad,
30. Delegation of Punjabi Pakhtoon Ittehad led by Mr. Ghulam Sarwar Awan	Political Leader	27-09-88	Karachi.

NAME	OCCUPATION/DESIGNATION	DATE	PLACE
31. Mr. Mehfooz Yar Khan	Political Leader Secretary Information Tehrike Istaqlal, Karachi	27-09-88	Karachi
32. Pukhtoon Action Committee	Political Leaders	27-09-88	Karachi
33. Delegation of All Pakistan Youth League led by Mr. Nihal Hashmi	All Pakistan Youth League	28-09-88	Karachi
34. Home Secretary Government of Sindh	Home Secretary	29-09-88	Karachi
35. Mr. Ghulam Mustafa Jatoi	Political Leader	29-09-88	Karachi
36. Mr. Mumtaz Ali Bhutto	Political Leader	29-09-88	Karachi
37. Mr. Masud-uz-Zam	Member FPSC	04-01-88	Islamabad
38. Prof. Ghafoor Ahmed, Naib Amir Jamaate Islami	Political Leader	31-10-88	Karachi
39. Mr. Abbas Khan	Inspector General Police Sindh	31-10-88	Karachi
40. Mr. Ayyaz Hussain Ansari	MBR Government of Sindh	31-10-88	Karachi
41. Mr. K.K. Bhattia	Director Implement at ion Cell, S&CAD, Government of Sindh	01-11-88	Karachi
42. Mr. Ashfaque Hussain Qadri	Registrar Karachi University	23-11-88	Karachi
43. Vice Chancellor NED University of Engineering and Technology Karachi	Vice Chancellor	04-11-88	Karachi
44. Mr. Masood Nabi Noor	Ex-Chief Secretary Sindh	22-11-88	Islamabad
45. Malik Muhammad Nawaz	Ex-Inspector General of Police, Sindh	23-11-80	Islamabad
46. Mr. Abdullah J. Memon	Ex-Home Secretary Sindh	24-11-88	Islamabad
47. Mr. Ali Muhammad Sheikh	Ex-Commissioner, Hyderabad	24-11-88	Islamabad
48. Mr. Shahid Nazir	Ex-Deputy Commissioner, Hyderabad	24-11-88	Islamabad
49. Mr. Diljan Khan	Additional Secretary M/o Interior	15-01-89	Islamabad
50. Group of Officers of Police Service of Pakistan comprising of:-			
i) Mr. Obaid-ur-Rehman	Chairman PSP Association		
ii) Mr. Salman Khaliq	D.G. FIA		
iii) Mr. M. Amin	Joint Director I.B.		
iv) Mr. Asad Mahmood Alvi	Deputy Commandant National Police Academy/Vice Chairman PSP Association	15-01-89	Islamabad
v) Raja Muhammad Aslam Khan	Deputy Director Intelligence Bureau		
vi) Dr. Muhammad Shoaib Suddle	Honorary Secretary PSP Association.		

ANNEXURE III

LIST OF DOCUMENTS/MEMORANDA SUBMITTED TO THE COMMITTEE.

BY POLITICAL LEADERS.

1. Mr. Altaf Hussain,
Leader of MQM.
2. Senator Syed Mazhar Ali
3. Ali Ahmed Qureshi,
Advocate Dadu.
4. Muhammad Usman Kanadi,
MQM.
5. Mr. Ghulam Sarwar Awan,
PPI.
6. Mr. Mumtaz Ali Bhutto,
Convener Sindhi Baloch Pakhtoon Front.

BY GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS.

1. Mr. Masud-uz-Zaman,
Member FPSC.
2. Mr. Abdur Rashid Hashmi,
Additional District Magistrate.
3. Home Secretary
Government of Sindh.
4. Mr. Salim Abbas Gilani,
Chief Secretary Sindh.
5. Mr. Ayyaz Hussain Ansari,
Member Board of Revenue, Government of Sindh.
6. Mr. K.K. Bhattia,
Director Implementation Cell, S & GAD, Karachi.

7. Mr. Masood Nabi Noor
Ex-Chief Secretary Sindh.

8. Malik Muhammad Nawaz,
Ex-Inspector General Police, Sindh.

9. Police Service of Pakistan,
Association, Islamabad.

BY EDUCATIONISTS.

1. Dr. Muhammad Sharif Memon
Principal Government Muslim Science College, Hyderabad.

2. Syed Qavi Ahmed,
Principal & Professor of Commerce, Government Sindh College of Commerce,
Hyderabad.

3. Prof. Muhammad Abdul Wakeel,
Principal Government College, Hyderabad.

BY EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS.

1. Sindh University,
Jamshoro.

2. Mehran Engineering University,
Jamshoro.

3. Agriculture University,
Tando Jam,

4. NED University of Engineering and Technology,
Karachi.

5. Liaquat Medical College,
Hyderabad.

6. Dow Medical College,
Karachi.

7. Dawood College of Engineering and Technology,
Karachi.

8. Nawabshsh Medical College,
Nawabshsh.

9. Chandka Medical College,
Larkana.

BY OTHER ASSOCIATIONS/ORGANIZATIONS.

1. Doctor's Organization,
Liaqat Medical College Hospital, Hyderabad/Jamshoro.

2. Mumtaz-ul-Haq Qureshi,
General Secretary, Sindh Pubjah Abadgar, Welfare Association, Latifabad, Hyderabad.

3. Haji Jannat Gul,
Chairman Panchait Committee,
Ward No. 9, Gujro Akakhail Colony,
Sector No. 47, Scheme No. 33,
Karachi East.

ANNEXURE IV

TRAVEL SCHEDULE OF THE SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON THE SITUATION IN SINDH.

DATE OF MEETINGS	VENUE OF MEETING
15th August, 1988	Islamabad
29th to 30th August, 1988	Karachi
21st to 23rd September, 1988	Karachi
24th September, 1988	Sann, Dadu, Betto
25th to 26th September, 1988	Jamshoro/Hyderabad
27th to 29th September, 1988	Karachi
04th October, 1988	Islamabad
31st October, to 01st November, 1988	Karachi
22nd to 24th November, 1988	Islamabad
15th to 16th January, 1989	Islamabad
05th March, 1989	Islamabad
09th March, 1989	Islamabad
15th March, 1989	Islamabad
22nd April, 1989	Islamabad
06th June, 1989	Islamabad
28th to 29th August, 1989	Islamabad
18th September, 1989	Islamabad
30th September, 1989	Islamabad
17th to 18th October, 1989	Islamabad
14th to 16th November, 1989	Islamabad
20th to 22nd November, 1989	Islamabad

ANNEXURE V

PUBLIC OPINIONS

As already observed the Special Committee on the Situation in Sindh in order to correctly assess the situation undertook extensive tours during which it held discussions with and interviewed a number of persons belonging to almost all the sections of the society. Those who were interviewed and their opinion recorded can be placed in three broad categories, namely:-

1. Politicians;
2. Bureaucrats/Government functionaries; and Notable citizens.
3. The views expressed by these persons are summarized as under: -

I POLITICIANS/OPINION LEADERS

A number of eminent politicians, including Governor, Sindh, ex-Chief Minister, Sindh, ex-Ministers, Senators, MNAs, MPAs, leaders of PPP, MQM, Muslim League, Sindh National Alliance, Tehreek-e-Istaqlal, etc, were interviewed. These persons while dwelling on law and order situation in Sindh identified the following reasons of these disturbances:

(A) CAUSES OF UNREST

- 1) Economic deterioration in Karachi, financial constraints, in particular, shortage of developmental funds and poor planning, which has resulted into lack of basic amenities.
- 2) Closely related is the problem of rapid growth of population, particularly, the influx of immigrants both from within the country and of the illegal immigrants from other neighboring countries.
- 3) Acute shortage of job opportunities and the resultant un-employment and under-employment.
- 4) Lack of educational facilities. Overcrowding of educational institutions. In addition weak administration and lack of discipline in the educational institutions.
- 5) Law enforcing agencies are inadequate in numbers, and ill equipped to meet the situation.

- 6) Arms smuggling, drug mafia and protection to miscreants by the influential's both in the rural urban areas.
- 7) Long periods of Martial law, presence of army and ban on political freedom.
- 8) Feelings of discriminatory treatment by various ethnic groups, and of deprivation and usurpation of rights.
- 9) Wrongful distribution of land and the unrest among the local *haris*.
- 10) Quota system. Two divergent opinions were expressed on this issue. Whereas the exponents of rural Sindh view point expressed bitterness regarding the non-enforcement of the stipulated quota, the leaders of MQM vehemently opposed the quota system demanding immediate abolition thereof.
- 11) Lack of provincial autonomy.
- 12) Alienation from the Islamic teachings, in particular, its principles of justice and equality.
- 13) Involvement of foreign elements in advocating separatist tendencies.
- 14) Vested interests of political parties.
- 15) Negative role played by the press.

B. PROPOSED SOLUTIONS.

1. Improvement in the planning to provide sufficient civic facilities.
2. Creation of job opportunities, especially in the rural areas by setting up of industries, including the agro-based industries.
3. Other parts of the country should also be industrialised to stop influx from other provinces.
4. Law and order agencies should be more effective and vigilant.
5. Illegal weapons should be recovered.
6. Local committees should be constituted with S.D.Ms and D.Cs. as their members.

7. For maintenance of peace law abiding people should be given prohibited bore arms to counter the threat of dacoits.
8. State agricultural land to be given to *Haris*.
9. More provincial autonomy.
10. Sindhis should be given representation in the local management.
11. The Government of Sindh should be run by Sindhis.
12. The Government of Sindh should be run both by Sindhis and Muhajirs.
13. Migrants who came in Sindh after 1954 should not be accepted as Sindhis.
14. Every citizen settled in the province of Sindh should be accepted as Sindhi without any difference of language and culture.
15. Protection to Sindhi language.
16. Democratic institutions must be established.
17. Party based elections to be held and army to be removed from Sindh.
18. There should be complete decentralization of powers down to the level of local bodies.
19. Royalty on gas and oil to be given to Sindh.
20. All the ethnic groups, that is, Sindhis, Muhajirs, Punjabis and Pukhtoons should be treated at par.
21. Discriminatory treatment being accorded to Sindhis should be stopped.

II BUREAUCRATS/GOVERNMENT FUNCTIONARIES:

Those who were interviewed, include Chief Secretary, Sindh, Mr. Masud-uz-Zaman, ex-Chief Secretary, Sindh Mr. Masood Nabi Noor, Secretary, Population Welfare, Malik Muhammad Nawaz, ex-I.G. Sindh, Home Secretary, Sindh, I.G. Police, Sindh, Mr. Ali Muhammad Shaikh, Deputy Secretary, Establishment Division Mr. Abdullah Memon, J.S. Finance Division.

(A) CAUSES OF UNREST

The following issues were identified as responsible for the unrest of the province, namely:-

1. These persons clearly felt that Karachi was a unique and distinct urban centre of the country and it was not It is a commercial comparable to any other city of Pakistan and financial Centre of Pakistan, having the largest concentration of industry and a population composition drawn from all the provinces of the country. In addition there was unprecedented increase in its population due to influx from within and out-side Pakistan, which had resulted into a number of socio-economic problems.
2. Shortage of basic amenities, pressures on infrastructure and resources, resulting from lack of funds.
3. Problem of transport, sewerage, water supply, etc.
4. Lack of co-ordination between different civic agencies.
5. Encroachments and *Katchi abadies*.
6. Large scale unemployment.
7. Quota system:
 - a) Quota system - Non observance of
 - b) Quota system - abolition of.
8. Police inadequacy and ill-equipped.
9. Delay in justice and non-redressal of grievances.
10. Student violence.
11. Narcotics and arms trafficking. Protection to miscreants by the influential persons and the political leaders.
12. Ethnic discrimination, apprehensions of Sindhis that they would be reduced to a minority.
13. Urdu as a medium of instructions.
14. Unreasonable behavior of Press.

15. Unjust allocation of land.
16. Vested political interest.
17. Indian insurgency.
18. Large scale migration from other areas of Pakistan into Sindh.

PROPOSED SOLUTIONS

The possible solutions suggested were as follows:-

1. Reorganization of government agencies, including the strengthening of police.
2. Provision of sufficient training facilities for police.
3. Allocation of special funds for the city of Karachi in particular and rest of Sindh in general.
4. The Improvement in the adequate supply and quality of basic amenities, including the educational facilities.
5. The Improvement of the grievance redressal system and providing up of speedy justice.
6. The toning up of the intelligence agencies so that they are able to pinpoint the subversive as well as criminal elements.
7. Exemplary punishment for possessing of illegal arms and strict enforcement of special laws, to be enacted to prevent riots.

3. NOTABLE CITIZENS

The notable citizens included professionals, both doctors and lawyers, educationists, agriculturists, and businessmen of standing belonging to all parts of Sindh. These persons expressed their frank views identifying causes of the unrest suggesting the possible solutions thereof. The causes of unrest in Sindh identified by them are mainly as under:-

1. Unemployment.
2. Lack of basic civic facilities and absence of proper planning.

3. Lack of educational facilities. In addition the lack of proper facilities in the educational institutions both indoor and outdoor for promoting healthy out-let of energies. In addition lack of discipline and over-crowdedness in the educational institutions.
4. Bureaucratic apathy and insensitivity.
5. Inadequacy/connivance of law enforcing agencies and absence of timely action/control.
6. Quota system.
7. Martial Law.
8. Exploitation of the masses by various political parties/leaders.
9. Ethnicity.

B. SOLUTIONS

The possible solutions included:

1. Opening of more educational institutions, in particular, the technical institutions. In addition the standard of education should be enhanced and if possible, the percentage of pass-marks should be raised to 50%.
2. More job facilities especially for the professionals.
3. More job opportunities for the local population in the industry. For this purpose the private sector should be involved, especially, to set-up agro-based industries in the rural areas.
4. Industrialization of other provinces to stop the influx of people in Sindh.
5. Red-tapism should be removed and the decision should be taken speedily.
6. Greater political freedom, including the holding of a party-based elections.
7. Police cases on political basis should be withdrawn and discouraged.
8. Improvement in the law enforcing agencies, including the intelligence agencies, to have an eye on all illegal Immigrants, particularly from India.
9. *Punchi'at* committees should be established.

10. Greater autonomy for the educational Institutions.

11. Revival of students' union.

12. As regards the quota system a number of divergent proposals were made depending upon the respective leanings of various persons.

i) One of the groups proposed that quota system should be adopted and strictly adhered to on Zonal as well as regional basis as was being done in Punjab.

ii) The other section of the people vehemently opposed the quota system and instead advocated the recruitment purely on the basis of merit.

iii) Another group proposed that the quota system should be reviewed.

iv) Still another proposed that strict quota should be fixed for non-Muslims both in jobs as well as in the educational institutions.